Partial transcript from FSF public comment session

10.12.22

15:38:17 So for example, if a student is in an ICT class and receives significant extra weights, they will receive significant extra weights to account for the cost of the second teacher in the classroom.

15:38:31 FSF covers classroom expenses at the K to 12 districts schools in in districts one to 32.

15:38:42 It does not cover the following non instructional programming like food custodial costs and busing d 75 or alternative programs which use different funding models.

15:38:55 It's not fun pre K, or three K.

15:38:58 It does not take into account charter school funding and funding for individual, as opposed to classroom IP services such as speech OT, pt one to one and fiber for professionals.

15:39:14 Funding for these other purposes including our large federal grants such as title 123 and four are allocated directly to the schools, outside of FSF.

15:39:27 The deal he has approximately 100 separate allocations to schools, each of which are accompanied by the school allocation memorandum or a Sam, the scope of the stamps, can be broad and their value may vary.

15:39:43 One Sam might go towards hiring a new teacher or social worker while another Sam could establish a new summer school or pay for computer maintenance.

15:39:55 You can find a full list of the Sams online on the deal ease info hope.

15:40:01 Next slide.

15:40:03 So fair student funding needs are determined on individual student basis, the weights at up by students, as shown in the examples here.

15:40:13 Each student is evaluated for their eligibility, based on the data in New York City public school systems in the examples shown on the slide, we have two students, Salman Alex, both students are extreme or elementary school students.

15:40:28 And this means they are both entitled to the K two five grade weight of 1.0, shown in the graph in the orange, middle and high school students start with a higher weight, middle school students is 1.08 and high school students have 1.03, both students

15:40:49 are English language learners, shown in green.

15:40:54 Sam is an elementary school multilingual learner enrolled in a standalone English as a new language program. Therefore, Sam is entitled to the K through five ml weight of point four zero.

15:41:09 Alex is also an elementary school multilingual and learner. Alex is enrolled at a bilingual program at his school. The school has approximately quoted appropriately quoted Alex as enrolled in a bilingual program in the DOE scheduling system stars.

15:41:29 As such, Alex is entitled to the Cato five bilingual way of point for for both students with disabilities requiring special education classroom instructional services, such as sets or special class or integrated ICT classes.

15:41:49 So Sam's individual individualized educational plan or his IP requires less than 20% of Sam's instructional program to be in an IP setting, therefore Sam is entitled to less than 20% of the special education weight of point five six, shown in the yellow

15:42:08 Alex's IP is 21 to 59% of Alex's instructional plan to be spent in the IP setting. Therefore, Alex is entitled to 21 to 59% of the special educational weight of 1.25, shown in the yellow both students are in need of additional academic support, therefore

15:42:34 they're entitled to that FSF academic intervene intervention weight of point one two shown in the blue.

15:42:43 When you add all of these pieces together.

15:42:47 Sam's FSF needs, total weight of 2.08. Wow, Alex's needs total 2.81.

15:42:58 These are then translated into FSS allocations and then schools receive other allocations. In addition, As mentioned above.

15:43:09 So if you go to slide nine FSF has five main categories of weight.

15:43:15 The first at the top, are the grade weights, all students receive one of these weights, based on grade level, middle school and high school grade weights are slightly larger to the need for additional coverage and preparation periods for teachers and

15:43:32 and the second group is academic intervention weights, these covers services for students who are falling behind or at risk of falling behind based on test scores.

15:43:44 Because poverty is correlated with academic need later in a student's career. We use poverty as a weight for students starting in grades. Before test scores are available all schools beginning before grade four.

15:44:00 Then the third group is English language learners weights.

15:44:04 These cover services associated with EML and bilingual classes for English language learners, these weights are updated were updated in 2016 2017 school year.

15:44:16 The last time the formula was significantly changed to account for new mandates for New York State.

15:44:24 Add bilingual weights and create a weight for students with interrupted formal education which will provide additional funding to many of the asylum seekers coming through New York City.

15:44:38 Currently, the fourth group is special education weights, these covers services associated with students with IPS and vary based on the services students received.

15:44:49 These are some of our largest weights, as they provide for very intensive services, less inclusive weights, generally referred to self contained settings, more inclusive to ICT settings last set of weights is portfolio weights, these weights are unique,

15:45:09 that they apply to all students at a given school, they can cover CTE and specialized programming at our high schools, including specialized academic weights, covering our specialized high schools and specialized audition weights, covering our schools

15:45:25 with extra arts programming.

15:45:27 We go to that next slide,

15:45:32 We go to the next slide.

15:45:38 Perfect. Prior to the adoption of SFSFSF in 2007 school budgets were not systematically set, according to the student need. Aside from limited federal funding FSF was adopted in 2007, and has been improved and refined over the years, including changes

15:45:59 to the academic needs, and special education weights in school year 2012 to 2013 and enhancements to the L weights in the school year 2016 to 17.

15:46:11 Additionally, new funds have been invested in fair student funding as new resources became available with all schools receiving 100% of their calculated fair student funding formula for the first time last year.

15:46:26 In July of 2022, the fair student funding working group was convened to examine the funding formula and make recommendations for changes to the Chancellor by October 31.

15:46:43 And at this point, I'm going to pass it over to Melissa, who's a working group member to take you through the proposed changes at the fair to the fair student funding program formula.

15:46:54 Next slide please.

15:46:56 So as we move to the next few sections.

15:47:00 I want these questions to get your thinking.

15:47:04 For the problems that we have identified. Are these the right solutions, because we've been working since July, like I said, we've come up with a lot of ideas, we put those ideas on paper and we want to share them with you.

15:47:20 But when you when we go over them, please just kind of use these questions as your guide. Are there other solutions that we should identify for these problems.

15:47:31 Are there other problems that we should identify as priorities, and knowing that financial resources are limited. Is this where funding should be prioritized.

15:47:50 Okay, so those are the questions, just take a quick look at it take a picture with your phone, you really want to finish this session on time and we we want it to be impactful.

15:47:57 So we are going to stick to these guiding questions and we ask that everybody please use these questions.

15:48:05 When they either ask questions, or submit ideas. Okay.

15:48:10 Next slide please.

15:48:13 So, the first thing. The problem was that schools do not receive additional funding through FSF to support students living in shelter and students in temporary housing.

15:48:26 We know that students living in shelter, and students living in temporary temporary housing, housing, come with a barriers that need to be dealt with in schools.

15:48:39 And so we are recommending, we are considering adding a way for students that live in temporary housing, so additional funds are given to schools for the students to support their learning problem, schools, especially small schools do not have sufficient

15:48:58 funding to open special education, education classes and address breakage issues, give you example of that small school has either one or two grades on one or two classes on every great.

15:49:12 There are 12 students. Three third graders of five fourth graders and the rest fifth graders, um, how do you provide services in one classroom, across all three great or do we do something where those students IPS or put at the forefront of this budget

15:49:30 and allow them to get exactly what the IEP says they need. Okay, so we are considering adding a weight for special education students and small schools.

15:49:39 So additional funds are giving to the schools for the students to support their learning. So, these two are there any questions.

15:49:49 Ideas concerns. We're going to stop right here for a quick minute and ask that you drop those into the chat.

15:50:11 was made in the chat, I Christina Do you know who's been in the chat.

15:50:18 There's different do we folks on the chat, would you like to open it up to comments as well.

15:50:28 Verbal comments.

15:50:32 Um, time wise Do we have time for that, I will. Yes, we. Okay. All right, so at this time if you'd like to verbally.

15:50:43 Present your idea your question.

15:50:46 Someone says hi I can't hear very well because we have a concert going okay, Aaron can't hear.

15:50:53 But she'll. It's okay to take live questions okay so if you want to ask a question to get some clarification about something that we've recommended or something that you want to recommend you can come on.

15:51:11 Okay, I will call them folks who are raising their hand.

15:51:16 All right, and then we'll check in with the language rooms as well and if you're raising.

15:51:22 If you'd like to raise your hand and you're calling in, please press star nine, and you will be called to speak shortly. Again, these are the

15:51:33 driving questions. Okay, the first speaker is Donovan Swanson, I will put, neither.

15:51:49 Hi Hello, I'm with Brooklyn Borough Hall I actually had a technical question it'd be more helpful to go back to your first set of recommendations, I'm sorry, the slide.

15:51:54 Yeah. The question was specifically when you say small schools for that second piece right what is qualifying as a small school in that case.

15:52:07 And so that's one of the things we did talk about is clearly drawing a line, then that will

15:52:15 tell us what school is considered a small school versus a large school. And we came up with a little formula. Maybe for K to five.

15:52:25 300 300 to 350, um, that was just one of our suggestions, middle school. I can't remember what form I think was 500.

15:52:38 And I'm not sure what they came up with high school, but that'll kind of give you idea what we thinking about.

15:52:46 That's going to be one of our suggestions really drawing a line in the sand to determine what is considered small school.

15:52:58 Things okay to not get it.

15:53:05 Okay, the next speaker is Leoni Hamsun.

15:53:12 Hi, I have a couple questions but I also want to provide input. Should I ask my questions first and then just go into my comments.

15:53:21 Yes.

15:53:23 Okay, I have two questions what happens if they the incoming student has no state test scores to speak of. How do you a lot. funding for that child.

15:53:35 And number two, why is it that special funding is allocated to the specialized high schools.

15:53:50 Given that the achievement level of those students are among the highest in in the city, excellent questions.

15:53:54 Should I wait for your answers or, or go and go on to my comments or how do you want to handle this.

15:54:01 Um, yeah go into the comments because we have somebody writing and then Aaron, they're working on your response so go ahead and go into your comments.

15:54:13 Okay.

15:54:15 So my name is Laney Simpson I'm the executive director of class size matters there's some very basic laws in the fair student funding system.

15:54:23 The formula provides insufficient resources to ensure that schools can meet basic students needs, forcing principles to excess staff and critical programs and services, as seen from this year's budget cuts that have had hugely damaging impacts on many

15:54:37 schools, the formula was designed in 2007 to incentivize principles to maximize class size, which is not only harmful to student learning but also potentially in conflict with the new state class size law recently signed by the governor, the fair student

15:54:53 funding Task Force created by the City Council in 2019 surveyed principles approved 80% identified large classes, as a consequence of the formula. The entire school funding system must be realigned to ensure that schools can meet the new staffing needs

15:55:09 mandated by the law, relevant to this issue is how the programs prioritized by successive administration's have been funded separately from the pair student funding formula, and are instead funding funded on the basis of the need to staff entire classes,

15:55:24 rather than based on individual students as the previous do the funding system was designed to do before fair student funding was introduced. There is precedent for creating a whole separate allocation system for smaller classes.

15:55:37 In fact, three K and pre k classes, as you mentioned in the introduction, are not subject to the formula instead schools are funded for an entire three K and pre k class no matter its size, and then kept it 15 to 18 students with one classroom teacher,

15:55:52 and one paraprofessional per class, if they're more students per class then these cap schools receive funding for a whole new class. This is so that they can meet the state law that caps class sizes in these grades.

15:56:04 Special Education pre k classes or Captain even smaller levels. The deal we also provide additional funding outside the formula to each school to quote sustain gifted and talented programs with enrollment lower than 18 students in grades K through three.

15:56:19 Although the regular class sizes in these grades can be as large as 25 and kindergarten and 32 and grades first through third this additional funding totals more than $2.8 million last year, and allowed schools in some districts to keep gifted classes

15:56:37 as small as six to eight students per class again this goes against the theory of fair student funding that the highest needs students are supposed to get the most funding and the greatest resources whether within the flawed bear student funding system

15:56:52 or in a separate school allocation is currently exists for three k pre K and gifted classes. I hope that this task force proposes the creation of an additional funding mechanism to support and ensure the phase in smaller classes in grades K through 12

15:57:12 at the legally prescribed levels. Thank you.

15:57:13 Thank you.

15:57:19 The festival funding formula includes a specialized academic weight meant to support, academic academically challenging high schools with supplement Terry instructions and assessment and this working group is discussing the weight and the selection criteria

15:57:37 on that. Also note, um, that the answer to your question about no incoming tests was the funding assumes that students with no income and test scores have the same average incoming performance as the rest of the students have with incoming test scores.

15:58:00 Thanks for your feedback.

15:58:03 The next speaker, or a did you want to go on to the next thing. There's a few more folks.

15:58:09 Okay, well let's take a couple of morning.

15:58:12 Okay, Johana 169.

15:58:17 Hey yo Hello, thanks for joining us.

15:58:21 Thank you, um, i, full disclosure, I was here yesterday too so I had a chance to actually see these recommendations then go back and look at some of the supporting documents.

15:58:31 And I'm wondering, with the small school issue. It seems to me like, you know, just some feedback that's just going to add a level of contentiousness that's.

15:58:45 But, you know, what happens when a school is 501 students I mean yeah still have breakage.

15:58:54 In the models and examples from other schools of examples were given us some positions funded outside the formula, Atlanta I think was one of the examples of a district that does that wasn't considered to actually fund special ed teachers outside the

15:59:08 formula, instead of deal making complicated convolutions and gymnastics to try to get it to work within the formula.

15:59:19 Thank you.

15:59:21 Thank you. That's awesome. Thank you would definitely take that back.

15:59:26 We have one more comment here in the Zoom Room al Su.

15:59:33 Yeah, so just have a question about the weight that's being proposed here. If you're adding a wait for students in temporary housing.

15:59:44 Then where is the funding being taken away from in order to account for this additional weight.

16:00:00 Thank you.

16:00:04 Well just, I don't see anybody raising their hand on the phone.

16:00:11 We will check in briefly with folks.

16:00:17 Is there anyone in Spanish, or Mandarin rooms.

16:00:21 Again it's star nine to raise your hand if you're calling in.

16:00:42 So the answer to that question I was just asked basically we all have to make a determination. If we pay for additional waste by subtracting from other ways, or seeking other resources.

16:00:57 And so, yeah, and that's why it's so important that you're here asking these questions because the committee has to put these put these ideas in a ranking order.

16:01:14 And so everybody's input is important because we want the chancellor and his team to look at the most pressing issue first and, you know, work their way down to include as many of our ideas as possible.

16:01:30 So, it's like, if you have a budget, and you go to the store and you know you decide to get a steak but you know your budget was only for chicken, you are going to have to reduce something else.

16:01:44 Along those lines in order to get that steak, but it is the steak, what you want. Is it, is it the best thing for the city and the students. If that's the case, then we know that yes, they are going to be some reductions in some of the other weights.

16:02:00 Okay, so we're going to move on.

16:02:03 The next items is school serving high proportions of concentrations of students with additional needs require additional funding and support to serve all students well.

16:02:18 Alright so we are recommending, adding an additional weight for schools serving high proportions and concentrations of students in poverty.

16:02:27 Students in temporary housing and etc.

16:02:32 Problem.

16:02:35 While the FSF does not recognize and provide schools with additional funding for many groups students, it does not provide additional funding for students, experiencing poverty, at all grade levels recommendations we are considering considering adding

16:02:54 an additional weight for students in poverty. So additional funds are given to schools for the students to meet their needs.

16:03:03 Does anybody have any questions, ideas or comments on these two elements.

16:03:13 So we are recommending replacing a current weight base, which is based on academic need with a weight for students in poverty.

16:03:35 Okay, we have a few folks whose hands are raised.

16:03:38 Okay, including some new voices so we'll start with Lisa Shay welcome O'Shea.

16:03:54 Please unmute you have a minute and 30 seconds to

16:04:03 let me sorry there.

16:04:05 Okay, we'll move on, come back. 10 chain.

16:04:14 Hello, can you hear me. Yes, yes.

16:04:16 So, um, I just have a comment about the sort of replacing the, the academic intervention way with the poverty way.

16:04:28 If I understand that correctly that seems to me to be the wrong way to go because I mean the entire when you.

16:04:37 It seems to me like there should be the formula should be defined by.

16:04:43 Where, where the need is and wouldn't the need be defined by academic intervention mean that that's more of a result, that's more of a results oriented formula where the ultimate.

16:04:57 You know, they're sort of like this this formula has two levels of need one level is like identifying student characteristics like student temporary housing, poverty, those types of demographic characteristics which are all important parts of the formula

16:05:12 but I think they're, you know should be some of the ultimate bottom line is, how to the students, ultimately performance school, and if they're eligible for academic intervention services, then that is the ultimate bottom line that should define some

16:05:26 sort of need for the students. And it seems to me that the formula should go the other way which is to say, You know, right and right now there I believe there is a poverty wait for K two three students.

16:05:40 It seems to me what should be happening is that the way it should be. You know the way that is used for fourth and fifth graders should be extended all for all the students in the school because you know school communities are fairly consistent and if

16:05:55 you have, you know, 30 4050, whatever the number is, you know, 50% of the students, eligible for academic intervention services, year after year, then that kind of like historical result tells you that you have that all those k two three students although

16:06:14 you don't have their scores this year, you pretty much know what's going to happen because, you know, school communities are demographically fairly consistent, you know, our admissions change so I just think that that would be the direction that should

16:06:29 be taken.

16:06:32 Thank you so much. Mr. Chang.

16:06:39 And then next. Well let's try Elisa O'Shea Are you there.

16:06:47 Hi. Sorry, I had a microphone issue.

16:06:50 Just a couple quick comments and I'm interested in speaking first on the issue at hand which is changing the way to reflect more services inside the schools for students who are in temporary housing or, you know, have a high level of poverty, my confusion

16:07:06 with this. It stems from the fact that a lot of social services and shelters already provide services for families indeed. And I'm wondering why we're moving the school based model into a more social services model.

16:07:25 I understand some schools allow children to do laundry and things like that and they you know they already provide extra meals for students for free. So what is this money going to be used for if we shift the funding that isn't already covered in the

16:07:39 shelter system, or in the social services system for families were already receiving, you know, budgets for their needs. And then the second thing I wanted to address was a comment previously about the gifted and talented program or other accelerated

16:07:57 learning environments, I just want to point out that one of the changes to fair student funding is to allocate more for students who are in special education or are receiving IP services, and a lot of students who are in the accelerated learning environment,

16:08:12 they actually are twice exceptional students, meaning that they have a disability or designation for learning environment to accommodate them, as well as having needs for more accelerated learning.

16:08:23 So I just want to point out that it's a dual population many times and that that should also be covered by fear student funding, all our students should receive an appropriate education.

16:08:35 And that was my comment. Thank you for allowing me to speak.

16:08:38 Thank you.

16:08:41 The next

16:08:44 speaker is Mark Gonzales.

16:08:52 Hi. Thank you again for letting me speak and I was on yesterday as well. I'm from CC, three, and also parents.

16:09:04 And I think there is a need for poverty, um, you know, we in district three our last meeting we were talking about how we get washers and dryers into many of our schools because there is a definite need for washers and dryers because we've got families

16:09:16 come in and have nothing, literally, and they need help in district three and we want to be able to provide help but we need to do we need to do their job and provide help so there is a need for that.

16:09:27 Let's be clear. There also is a need for academic intervention funding as well in academic intervention happens to all kids, it does not matter what their income level is and we need to make sure we're taking care of all of our kids who need additional

16:09:42 help, and to say we're going to pit one group against another doesn't make sense. We've got a $28 billion budget. We have plenty of funds to use. We have a $98 billion city budget there is plenty of money this is not a zero sum game.

16:10:00 We've got plenty of funds there's plenty of money in a Sams.

16:10:03 It's a matter of what we want as a community, and we need to be very clear about that and I also say there is nowhere near enough money for students with disabilities, I've got a son who can't get his ICT that's on his IEP right now because of school

16:10:18 can't afford it. It's insane. But that's what's happening. I mean, right now, those who need the most, get the least those who need it, the least get the most in funding, we see it with the point three five and 2.12, and make no sense.

16:10:35 Thank you. Thank you. Thank you.

16:10:41 Okay, go ahead.

16:10:42 Oh no, no, go ahead. Are you going to respond. And let me say that I'm like I said in the beginning.

16:10:49 I have been in the system. 30 years I've been a principal for 1415 really, and I work in a high poverty.

16:10:59 School I've always worked in high priority community. And I can tell you that as a principal.

16:11:06 When we look at the data, and all of the students need academic help get that academic help those students that come from high poverty areas, there are an entire menu of things that we need to do for them but we don't have the opportunity to do it because

16:11:24 we run out of money, most high poverty students I'm going to say 90%, and you know that's definitely not a direct number. I'm have some academic needs that haven't been addressed because of their situations.

16:11:40 Um, I can tell you that every principle is looking at every child that needs academic assistance, because that's the group, he or she wants to move at all times.

16:11:49 So they're setting up you know after school programs two or three days a week, small group tutoring during the day. Um, but those schools, especially small schools.

16:11:58 Schools with high poverty, don't run out of funds within the first two or three months to provide services for students. And that's why we kind of looked at it in that and looked at it in this vein that you see right here on the screen.

16:12:13 Um, who's up next.

16:12:17 and the next folks have spoken but Leoni Hampson.

16:12:27 Yeah, I have a tech. I have a technical question which is how is poverty measured now in schools, given the parents are no longer asked to fill out pre lunch forms and is the data that results from whatever methodology that is being used ever assessed

16:12:49 to see how reliable it is.

16:12:52 Thank you.

16:12:54 The next speaker is Al student.

16:13:03 Yes, so I disagree with the first speaker who oppose the increasingly wait for poverty.

16:13:12 And I agree with the previous speaker, Mr. Gonzalez plus to provide context to the other speaker Alyssa, I say that increasing the weight for poverty, really is an excellent idea.

16:13:25 And the reason is you know there are many schools that are close to qualifying for Title One funding, but are below the 60% threshold. So schools that are you know have 55% whatever percent of kids who are called free lunch, don't get that extra funding.

16:13:43 And that's not fair at all.

16:13:45 So schools in these situations should have access to additional funding that title one schools receive.

16:13:52 So I think there should be an increase weight for kids for schools that have high levels of poverty.

16:14:01 And this is one really good way to address it. So, that's my comment. Thank you.

16:14:06 Thank you.

16:14:07 Thank you.

16:14:12 Um, we have this question How is poverty measure I just want to make sure we kind of get our answer we can.

16:14:18 Okay, we are moving on to the next phase Thank you so much.

16:14:26 So priors is another Carter sorry.

16:14:31 There are a couple comments I'm okay we could stay with us. I'm Miriam, or it's de faire.

16:14:41 Okay, we have plenty of time.

16:14:46 Miriam Are you there.

16:14:50 So we go to working on your poverty Hello, Can you hear me There you are. Hi. Sorry I'm having a tech problems. I'm on cc six I represent district six and I just want to say that I think you do need to add money for schools with poverty, higher poverty

16:15:10 and with higher numbers of students with, with the homeless system. We in district six happened to have a lot of both and have had for many years and it's very difficult for those parents to raise funds for their schools, and we all know that a lot of

16:15:30 the schools supplement their community events, their, their, you know their memory building the social emotional support through PTA activities, and it's a challenge in schools where you have high concentrations of poverty and homeless students, those

16:15:48 parents are just not able to support the schools financially and fundraising and it's hard for principals to build community with no money.

16:16:00 So I think it's an absolute necessity to increase funding where there is an increased need just because there's money and support in the homeless system it's not necessarily money that goes into the school where those children attend and helps them, have

16:16:17 a better experience the eight hours that that that they tend to be in that building. So please increase the funding.

16:16:26 Thank you much.

16:16:28 Thank you.

16:16:30 The next speaker is Gabrielle felt Berg.

16:16:37 Welcome Gabrielle.

16:16:42 Hi, my name is Gabriel Tilburg on both parties.

16:16:43 Hello.

16:16:46 Can you hear me.

16:16:47 Yes we hear you. Thank you. Thank you. My name. My name is Gabriel fell Berg on the principle of Central Park East one in East Harlem in District Four.

16:16:56 I just wanted to comment on the weights that I think is in equity to be remediated. The first is that schools that do not receive that are not Title One schools overall with that meet the threshold to be a school wide program.

16:17:11 Title one school actually received supplementary funding for students who are in temporary housing, or do not receive that money, but schools that don't qualify for Title One, in other words don't have the higher concentration poverty, they do currently

16:17:24 under the formula, get additional funds for students in temporary housing. That's an equity to be remedied because it's the opposite of what we're talking about.

16:17:34 And the second thing is I want you to make a distinction as we're talking about, students in temporary housing, and students in shelters which are two terms that have been used interchangeably here, temporary housing includes things like being doubled

16:17:47 up or living in a hotel.

16:17:50 But the shelter system is its own specialized system in New York City. And I think the needs are different than say having, you know your own independent housing unit even if you are sharing with another family.

16:18:03 And so I think there would be a way to count.

16:18:07 Some wait for general categories of temporary housing, and then additional weight as identified in a Ts for serious specifically in shelters, who I think should be given additional weight.

16:18:23 And the last speaker for this section we have is touching.

16:18:30 Welcome touching.

16:18:31 Thank you.

16:18:33 I think I already went, Oh did you go for this one. Okay, I didn't. The hand is still raised. So, thank you. I'm sorry.

16:18:41 That's okay.

16:18:43 Alright so, then we can continue. Thank you, Melissa.

16:18:48 Okay.

16:18:51 Ok supporting small schools. Next slide, please.

16:18:56 So the problem is, every school gets a base allocation of $225,000 per school. This is not adequate to allow small schools to staff appropriately.

16:19:08 So I recommendation is, we're looking at two ways to increase the base wait for all schools, either to cover the salary of an additional staff person, or three additional staff.

16:19:24 Next problem. Schools, especially small schools do not have sufficient funding to open special ed classes special education classes and address breakage issues.

16:19:36 Our recommendation.

16:19:38 Adding a weight for special education students in small schools. So additional funds are given to the students.

16:19:48 floor is now open for comments, questions, concerns.

16:20:05 Okay, or first hand raised. I'll try to get new folks first if they raise their hands first comment is Leoni Hanson.

16:20:16 Yeah, the first bullet points seems really weird to me, either to cover the salary of one additional staff person or three additional staff people.

16:20:26 How was that determination made.

16:20:30 The other thing. My concern is that we are giving again extra funding to small schools.

16:20:37 And maybe we should not be encouraging small schools but merging more schools to make them more efficient, and able to provide the services that their students need, rather than further subsidizing them.

16:20:53 Thanks.

16:20:57 Thank you.

16:20:59 The next speaker is Donovan Swanson.

16:21:05 Hi, Thomas on so we'll get with Brooklyn borough president's office, I just wanted to add something maybe for the working group to consider right and trying to close the gap and disparity is also considering again the quality of teachers and within that

16:21:22 conversation also years of experience. And that also kind of correlating to annual salaries and while this solution proposed doesn't necessarily address that how do we kind of close the gap and trying to incentivize or again consider funding to benefit,

16:21:46 having higher quality and I only associate that with again years of experience, because that's what the data tells us, Those salaries again making sure that the schools in need again those that also currently with the highest poverty, those would students

16:21:54 in temporary housing those with a lot of learners and things of that nature, have those teachers with more experiences so there that that budget reflects that so kind of incentivize because as we know what budget cuts teachers being access.

16:22:09 That's the opportunity to hopefully potentially lose some of those features that might be beneficial.

16:22:14 In closing that disparity so that's something to factor and I don't necessarily how you consider in this conversation. I do agree. I think the language of top is a little confusing looking for more clarity on that, but just something to consider in this

16:22:25 conversation of the salaries of teachers.

16:22:31 Thank you. All right to the first question on base weights, we modeled

16:22:39 on the first question on base weight, we modeled those two versions of a proposal to allow the working group members to understand the impact on a range of schools, with a small dollar value, and a large dollar value.

16:22:56 Okay, um, and a comment to the last

16:23:03 speaker.

16:23:05 Anytime there's access and done.

16:23:09 Um, it is the brand new teachers. Unfortunately, we can access based on anything besides seniority.

16:23:18 And so, you know, that's just where we are this that's the way the system is built right now. And so, anytime that the city has a mass exodus, it will always be the brand new teachers

16:23:38 there any other comments in the chat.

16:23:42 Yeah, there's a there's a bunch of hands raised.

16:23:49 Tomorrow stern.

16:23:52 Welcome.

16:23:55 Hi, I'm, I just would like clarification like what do you mean by additional staff, but I just wanted to understand because I you know I do have a childhood special education.

16:24:13 Are you guys, specifically mean like ICT teachers Paris school leads are you talking about like a speech teacher says teacher, open them up. Yeah, yeah.

16:24:20 Yeah, yeah. Okay, I just wanted to be clear, that's okay. Yes yes could be the ICT teacher could be a pair, it could be. Yeah, anything that's going to help us meet the requirements of IEP.

16:24:31 This this also include in case you don't have a staff in the building. I'm getting additional staff outside as well.

16:24:37 Yes. Okay, that's what I just wanted to be clear. Thank you.

16:24:41 You're welcome.

16:24:44 Thank you, next speaker is Nan Richardson.

16:24:54 Welcome there.

16:25:00 Um, as a parent of two students who matriculated at the urban assembly New York corporate school as the past PTA president of the school, or CTE school has very special needs that aren't that are pretty unusual and not remotely met by the flat of your

16:25:22 student funding that's offered. Like the CTE demands. We have to because of court regulations limit our CTE classes from 222 to one or 15 to one, but FSF doesn't really account for that we're such an outlier compared to We are a small school so I love

16:25:37 the things that you're moving towards here because that would help us, but we are also an outlier and we have a very unique situation. We also have a high incidence of students with the IEP is my own two children were among the need greater degrees of

16:25:51 instruction and counseling.

16:25:54 And while we're hovering above Title One status with a 70% free lunch.

16:25:59 And we embrace the deal with diversity plan pretty early. We just don't have the resources needed for the underserved student group that we have. And, you know, we all know statistics mean that that those kids lag behind and graduation rates in grades

16:26:14 and regions and and successful college or career transitions. So, I, I think that all of these schools are really terrific for small schools like ours.

16:26:25 But we also have this kind of odd situation with our city needs that won't fit into a formula to easy so easily. So I am very curious to see if there's any kind of possibility for a school that's as unique as ours.

16:26:42 Thank you.

16:26:45 Thank you.

16:26:47 Thank you.

16:26:50 And the next speaker is Miriam, or rusty fair.

16:26:55 Welcome Miriam.

16:26:57 Thank you.

16:26:59 My comment and concern is with using adding money to special education I'm the parent of two children with IPS one recently graduated high school.

16:27:13 And I'm in a district with. I'm in district six, and we have many children with IPS and we have many struggling small schools and my concern is are we stealing from Peter to pay for Paul, and why are we not just addressing the special education, lack

16:27:30 of funding and ability of small schools to, to, to function. I just feel like we're going to take money from somewhere and I'm all for supporting eye peas at small schools because I know how they struggle.

16:27:48 And I know how the providers struggled and were you know basically traveling from school to school, which is not ideal because they need to build relationships with children, to better serve them.

16:28:02 But I'm very concerned that we're just not addressing state mandated special education requirements.

16:28:09 That is that is a bucket of money that should be addressed. And I don't know if this is the proper way to do it. Just because the money is here.

16:28:19 That's my concern and observation. Thank you.

16:28:24 Thank you.

16:28:26 Thank you.

16:28:30 The last speaker I see for this comment is owl Susan.

16:28:35 Welcome.

16:28:37 Hi, um, so I think you know this is a very good idea because increasing the base allocation should reduce the volatility right due to the changes enrollment know as we experienced severe cuts to some school budgets this year, the summer.

16:28:56 However, the base allocation should not really be a one size fit all number.

16:29:02 Of course staff needed to operate a school should vary depending on the size right and type of school.

16:29:10 So for example, you know if it's a small school and medium school large school, that should, you know, that amount should vary.

16:29:18 And then you also have to consider whether it's a K to five school six to eight school or night 12 school so I think you have to take some more variables into account.

16:29:29 And, you know, increasing base allocation Yes, but you have to figure out the correct amounts for each type of school.

16:29:37 And lastly to clarify what one speaker asked whether this funding is used to cover professionals. I don't think so. I think the 225 K.

16:29:47 Currently covers the salary the principal and Secretary, and then increasing the base allocation really is intended to cover staff, whose positions don't really depend on the enrollment, right, such as the principal assistant principals.

16:30:03 So that's what I want to say thank you.

16:30:06 Thank you, and you are correct. And so we looked at, you know that base allocation. And, you know, trying to decide whether all of that, like the secretary the principal the AP, the guidance counselor you know there are certain needs that every school

16:30:21 has. And so, should that Alan base allocation just automatically set that those salaries up. And so we've definitely have talked about that in our meetings and we are looking at suggested some of those suggestions, so thank you.

16:30:37 I see another hand just popped up Johana 169.

16:30:44 I wanted to add on to what the previous speaker just said about the base allocation I think it's essential to reducing the volatility of the formula and it's subject to the middle the vagaries of the video adjustment.

16:30:58 It's also something that they really, otherwise the only way schools can afford these things is by increasing class size, there's a break even inherent in the fair student funding formula, it takes a certain number of students per capita to cover the

16:31:12 teacher salary and you only get guidance counselor's assistant principals secretaries, but a recess monitors, to say nothing and professional development and say nothing of enrichment after you exceed that breakeven, And so taking that money out of the

16:31:29 weights and putting it into a base foundation is something that brings stability to schools, and is also being much more transparent about the true instructional needs that I think that we can all agree that all students deserve.

16:31:46 Thank you.

16:31:52 Thank you, everybody spoke for this.

16:31:56 Okay. Okay, we're going to move on.

16:32:01 Next slide please. Okay, our next problem portfolio way to drive additional funds to a narrow set of schools recommendations we are considering moving removing specific portfolio categories.

16:32:17 These include specialized academic high schools, specialized audition screws. Career and Technical Education CTE schools and transfer schools.

16:32:30 Problems schools with staff with higher salaries have to use up more of their budgets on salaries and have less to pay for other services recommendations we are considering charging all schools the same amount for each teacher, regardless of actual teacher

16:32:47 salaries.

16:32:50 The floor is now open for your questions, concerns and suggestions.

16:33:09 Yeah, the first has

16:33:18 welcome Liana.

16:33:21 Yes, I support the first bullet point it makes no sense to me really that the specialized academic schools in particular, should be getting extra funding given that those are the schools with the highest, the highest achieving students.

16:33:36 The second bullet point I don't really understand, does that mean that schools would not pay for the salaries of their teachers out of their own budgets, but it, do we would cover those salaries, no matter what they were.

16:33:53 And I also know know what happened.

16:33:57 Yeah, we go ahead. Right, yeah. What happens now that schools are are charged a average amount based on how long that teachers have been working in the Department of Education.

16:34:09 So if you're a principle that has has built an amazing environment in a school, and you've been there over 10 years like myself and your teachers love being there, and they don't want to leave, every year on penalize because my teachers have longevity,

16:34:25 versus to school down the street or to school around the corner that has just opened up three years ago, every teacher has less than two or three years.

16:34:35 And so an example might be if she has 20 teachers, um, after she after her initial weight is removed for all of our teachers, she has $2 million left.

16:34:46 And when my initial weight is moved for all of my teachers, I have 95,000 left. And so, we are recommending that it's just a base salary for every teacher because every school needs teachers, no matter what it should not be based on a longevity, because

16:35:03 that no I understand I understand that that that schools with experienced teachers pay more for those teachers, but the solution for that problem is what you're recommending that that the deal we cover that additional salary bump for schools so that they're

16:35:22 not penalized for having experienced teachers is that the recommendation.

16:35:28 Um, yeah, pretty much, or just charging, every single school the same amount for a teacher, which equation.

16:35:37 Yeah, like every you know like when the wind an initial.

16:35:42 Right, okay. The, the, the comment that I had which sort of flowed out of Joanna's comment also is one of the concerns I have about the fear student funding formula is that it is focused on remediation and other words the students that are struggling

16:36:02 and falling behind. Get more funding in order to deal with the remediated costs of trying to bring them up to average levels.

16:36:10 But what the research shows about schools, is that prevention is much more effective than remediation. And that's yet another reason why we should be focusing our efforts on smaller classes.

16:36:24 Many parents believe that if their kids have gotten small enough classes in the first place they would not have been identified as needing IPS and eating special intervention services.

16:36:35 So I'm concerned that we're building a system that is based on expanding interfaith intervention services at the expense of prevention.

16:36:46 Thank you.

16:36:47 Thank you.

16:36:50 The next speaker is Elise O'Shea.

16:37:01 Hi, I'll try to keep an eye on the clock This time, I'm so I'm the Queen's rep on the city council on high schools that's one of the reasons I tuned in today.

16:37:08 And as someone who did the C 37 process for many of these schools, the portfolio schools to CT specialized transfer international d 79.

16:37:18 I believe that in order to keep these schools functioning at a high level, and you know, attracting the best talent for teaching, we need to keep those budget lines from the salaries for those teachers, right, because we want our students to come out

16:37:33 of our high schools with the best possible outcomes. We want them to know what it takes to succeed in the workplace. And we need teachers who actually have that experience.

16:37:44 How do we keep those teachers in our system right because if you can earn much more out there working in a trade job or working out in, you know, some specialized field, why would you come and teach yes teaching is a passion and I understand many people

16:37:59 sacrifice to work in this field, but to attract that technical talent, we really need to keep those budget lines for those particular schools and the designation for portfolio schools.

16:38:09 These schools allow students alternate ways to graduate alternative methods, other than regions, creating portfolio systems for them to go out in the work world with real cases of experience with real studies of how they're going to approach a problem

16:38:24 in their field when they get out. And I think we need that designation and we need those budget lines to keep those teachers in place. Thank you.

16:38:33 Thank you.

16:38:35 Thank you.

16:38:38 I don't see any other hands raised cannot start nine if you're on the call.

16:38:49 Oh. Now, a few hands raised, okay, dominance. Swanson.

16:38:56 Yeah, this is more of a question. I'm in just bundling again specialized academic school specialized audition school CT schools and transfer schools. I think transfer schools in specific regions kind of concerned me being bundled here, just because we

16:39:12 know transfer students have particular needs.

16:39:29 And so, it's again more of a question because I do think again in a way that this is where to hear might be just a little bit confusing but really to kind of understand the rhyme and reason why transfer schools are lumped into this, because again, I would

16:39:31 imagine.

16:39:38 And so, I don't know, just again in the conversation that salary is just more clarity on this would be helpful on this call please.

16:39:48 Thank you.

16:39:49 Thank you.

16:39:52 The next speaker is Nan Richardson.

16:39:59 Yeah, hi I just wanted to echo with the last speaker said is that I'm concerned to that your lumping career and technical education schools and with specialized edition schools for the same reason that there's, you know, the 17 years that we have teaching

16:40:14 CT at our school for example do have a very specific sort of educational history expertise. They're not that easy to find in marine maritime education, you know, this is a real specialty area, it is not easily exchangeable.

16:40:35 And so I'm a little uneasy about this idea that they could just be leveled, So I'd like a little more clarity on the whole thing to. Thank you.

16:40:46 Thank you.

16:40:51 Thank you. The next speaker is touching.

16:40:57 Walk okay.

16:40:59 Hi. Yeah, thanks. I just wanted to make a comment about the the first bullet point on portfolio weights.

16:41:09 It just seems to me that this is sort of the wrong approach to the fair student funding formula, which, for the most part is driven by students and student needs this part of the formula is sort of the, you know, these arbitrary school classifications.

16:41:27 You know, I would say maybe in the case of transfer schools you could make the case that you could transform that way into a transfer.

16:41:35 you know, the students that go to transfer schools. But then, really, these, these weights should be attributed to the needs that are identified. I think once you once you look at it on a student basis rather than on a school basis.

16:41:52 It really starts to raise questions as to why some of these weights even exist. You know, I mean we have, we have students, for example, who get into specialized high schools, and don't attend specialized high schools.

16:42:06 So, they are demographically exactly the same students that attend specialized high schools, but the funding that goes with them is much lower if they decide to attend their local high school or, or go to a different school.

16:42:21 And so I think we really need to be thinking about why the schools have the funding they do and and i think in the case that transfer schools you can make a case, you know, you know, these are challenged students and the demographic way that should be

16:42:34 associated with that. Thank you.

16:42:37 Thank you.

16:42:42 I don't see any more hands at the moment.

16:42:48 Okay.

16:42:50 So at this time.

16:42:52 We are going to ask that if you have any additional questions, any additional feedback. Other thoughts for the working groups to consider. You may present those at this time.

16:43:04 I want to thank everybody for coming. We gather some amazing information from you guys. We will definitely take it back and sit with the working group, and we'll have in depth conversations and

16:43:20 every comment will be addressed, every idea will be addressed and discussed and note this was an hour and a half of your time but it really made a difference to the work.

16:43:43 Yeah.

16:43:44 Thank you all for participating. I know there are no hands up.

16:43:48 I just want to remind folks of the questions that you, you started with which were for the problems that we identified Are these the right solutions. Are there other solutions that we should identify for these problems.

16:44:15 should identify as priorities and and knowing that the financial resources are limited. Is this where funding should be prioritized and so if anything sort of comes up that may or may not have been addressed, please feel free to share that we have 15

16:44:19 more minutes left to our session and would love to continue to gather information.

16:44:23 We've got some hands.

16:44:24 Nice.

16:44:26 All right, we'll go to leave Bay Hernandez.

16:44:30 Welcome.

16:44:32 Hi, thank you so much for doing this.

16:44:34 It's been really informative, but I did have questions regarding.

16:44:40 Are these solutions.

16:44:41 One of the other or. It sounds like you guys are considering adopting some changes, but is there a possibility that a lot of these changes that are the recommendations can be are going to be considered as a whole, because I feel like a lot of the needs

16:45:03 and spoken for are all needed from a base school allocation to increasing weights for particular demographics that were never accounted for.

16:45:15 As well as, meaning, you know, the possibility of eliminating specialized high schools, I will say that after hearing this speaker from district school but I'm familiar with the CTE.

16:45:28 I would consider maybe transfer schools and CTS be not lumped into that same group.

16:45:37 But I feel in regards to the specialized high schools meeting these teachers that they say they pay extra, the suggestion of if do he had a base rate for all teachers because we all know teachers are needed.

16:45:52 In addition to our nurses, social workers, and many of the issues or recommendations, kind of address that. My question is, can all of these recommendations be put forth, or is this one or the other, maybe to.

16:46:11 I do see that the specialized week could be used for some of these to fulfill the other recommendations, but is there a possibility for more to be done.

16:46:20 Oh, absolutely. We are working until 31st. And so all of this information that we gathered today will be taken back to the table there'll be a heavy discussions.

16:46:39 as possible. And so we're going to, you know, we kind of kind of wait them, like in importance, all the way down, and hopefully he's going to continue to grab until they can't grab any more ideas and make it work.

16:46:50 But yes, we are looking to put them all forth.

16:46:58 And we have another hand and Johanna 169.

16:47:06 Here I am again sorry to be hogging some bandwidth but I did my homework last night I spent so much time with the supporting documents and thank you for making them available for your first question Are you, are you addressing the right questions you

16:47:17 are not I mean I think if you are not addressing the midyear adjustment, and the outsized impact that has on school budgets at a time when they cannot afford and cannot manage the amount of money that's in swing, then you are dealing with the wrong question.

16:47:32 I did you know I looked at the supporting documents from and the examples from other districts, other districts must have faced this problem and I'm very very disappointed not to see more discussion I think you have time to deal with that you need to.

16:47:46 And the other thing with regard to modeling, I was also disappointed, especially since you're looking at this from an equity lens to see that all the modeling showed economic continue to use just impact per person average across the district as the impact

16:48:01 of the model. That doesn't seem to me to be getting to what we want to be doing which is to look at the ethical effectiveness it just seems that that is going to lead to conversations about that are going to be political in nature because it's going to

16:48:13 be geographical.

16:48:15 Maybe that's a reality but I would love to see some modeling that actually shows the impact on the schools that are affected as opposed to just district Pew per per pupil averages.

16:48:26 Thank you.

16:48:27 Thank you.

16:48:29 Um Can I just ask you a question about the meteor adjustments What was your concern about that I'd like to take some notes badly.

16:48:46 The schools are funded according to projections that are set by that are set by Central, and then are adjusted into rounds based on actual enrollment and the school see the funding of the media adjustments in November and then again in February.

16:48:49 Um, the meteor adjustments are, you know, for those people who may not be be familiar.

16:49:02 Since most of 85%, according to the supporting documents in the most schools is even higher than that goes to teacher salaries November is way too late in the school year to be looking to add teachers and there's nothing you can do to wait there no there

16:49:21 no levers, you can pull except for cutting programs if you have, have a deficit. And since. In, especially in recent years enrollment has not been stable.

16:49:33 This is a reality that's affecting schools greatly it's the, the, it is the cause of the budget cuts that we are seeing this year and the budget turmoil it's affecting three quarters of New York City Schools and there's no reason to think about that,

16:49:48 this is going to be any different.

16:49:50 Going forward, so that's my comment.

16:49:53 Okay, Thank you so much to see.

16:49:56 This is why these gatherings are so important, because that wasn't brought up, but I'm just additional clarity. For those that don't know. So an example would be a school on the corner is projected for 300 students at the beginning of the year.

16:50:23 On October 31 so that they are giving a, a budget. That is a is for two 300 students but by October 31, the budget, the population of students is now at two or one.

16:50:32 So they are negative 99 students. And so, in November that money is taken out of the that budget. And if a principal has already designated where that money is going to be used.

16:50:48 And who's what classrooms, whatever.

16:50:50 If it comes back that they have to give the city back 150,000 that happens in November.

16:50:56 And so that is what she is saying that November is too late for that to happen, because it does send a school and abroad, if they have large sums of money, have to be sitting back so that's something we will look at it the table but thank you so much

16:51:10 that was, that was definitely a great addition to this conversation.

16:51:21 We have a couple more comments, I'm

16:51:28 not sure if they spoken in this section but looping Hernandez.

16:51:36 I did but I will, I would like to just raise that on the opposite spectrum that when the projection levels are lower than even what the principal knows they're getting in September and many principles this summer filed appeals to do to these low projections.

16:51:57 They don't get the money as quick as the do we wants it back from the school, if it's under. So if the GOP now owes the school money, like she the previous speaker said November's too late and February's impossible as well.

16:52:12 But these schools don't get the money as quick as the deal he wants it back.

16:52:17 After knowing a lot of the schools have.

16:52:23 So it's, it's a system that is not that needed to be fixed at that level for sure because regardless of the amendments are changes.

16:52:34 If these policies still exist we're, we're not holding our schools, and the students to Great.

16:52:54 And so to bring clarity to what she said it so that same school with the 300 say by October 31 they have 400 nada nada Department of Ed is going to give the school.

16:52:58 the money for the additional hundreds hundred students in November December. And what does a principal do at that point.

16:53:15 Thank you. We have one more. Two more yeah we have one to two more hands Yeah, I'm Donovan Swanson.

16:53:24 Welcome.

16:53:34 I do think again in the measure of poverty and I think that's a route conversation right it's very foundational that the measure, you know, being free and reduced lunch programs.

16:53:46 Unfortunately no longer really serves our education landscape and I really do hope that this working group considers alternatives that might actually frame, the conversation, better and I think even if you know if that then became part of the solution

16:54:00 kind of putting two schools and looking at what they would have been funded under the prior measure and then possibly this new metric. If that actually ends up you know again closing the gap and bringing us more to an equitable landscape as far as school

16:54:15 funding is concerned because it just is not reflective again of what we're seeing in 2022 i mean you know there's tons of bodies of research on different possible alternatives I don't necessarily want to put one forth at this moment.

16:54:28 But again, I just think that the fruit free and reduced lunch programs, it's not a it's not a good metric for multiple reasons.

16:54:35 Thank you so much. And if you have an idea, anybody on the call if you have any ideas, please email festooned funding at schools that NYC that book will be taken all of the information that you contribute back to the drawing board into the table.

16:54:51 We have one more hand, and then we're going to close out.

16:54:58 Yes, Leoni Haimson.

16:55:04 Yeah, my comment flows from Joanna's comment and also lupus comment about the mid year adjustments.

16:55:12 I visited schools that had something like 50 migrant students this year, and they're still coming in and yet the school has got no extra funding to deal with those students has no Spanish speaking counselors.

16:55:26 There is an article in The New York Post today about another school that has gotten something like 80 migrant students and only has one teacher that's qualified to teach in Spanish.

16:55:39 And so I think that the DOE, there has to be a mechanism by for the deal we to respond more quickly than November, even February to the needs of the students when enrollment especially enrollment a very high need students like these surge in specific

16:55:57 schools, and also the issue of giving back money if the enrollment does not come up to what the projected amounts are.

16:56:07 I've had principals tell me that this is a huge disincentive for them to hire enough teachers at the beginning of the year, because they'd simply don't know whether they're going to have to, you know, either access them or pay back money later, and then

16:56:21 the following year.

16:56:23 And so I'm wondering if any of the other weighted student funding systems that the task force studied has the same mechanism as is used in the by the deal we to take back money in the middle of the year or the next year if enrollment projections don't

16:56:44 come out, where they were where they were originally thought to be.

16:56:49 That's my question.

16:56:50 Okay, thank you. Thank you.

16:56:53 Thank you. Yeah.

16:57:01 Hi, thank you for allowing me to speak I realized we're running out of time. I just want to make two final comments just in response to some of the previous speakers who want to split out the CTE and transfer schools.

16:57:14 I believe that the accelerated schools the portfolio schools international schools, they should all receive equal funding for those teachers that they need, who are specialized teachers and that includes the accelerated learning environments.

16:57:26 It's really hard to find a BC calculus teacher, or an AP physics teacher, and our students deserve to learn the top STEM skills so they can go to the best colleges and go in the workforce and compete with everybody else.

16:57:39 And I really feel that that money is well spent. We really need those teachers in place and unfortunately they cost more. The last comment I want to make is, I'm on the city council high schools, as I mentioned, and I realized one of your task force members

16:57:53 Ted leather was representing our council without our knowledge. We just want you to be aware that he is the subject of an ethics investigation right now, and none of us authorized his entry onto this task force, and I don't feel that he should be working

16:58:07 with budgets, at this time. Thank you so much.

16:58:13 Hey, thank you so much.

16:58:17 This has been an absolutely eye opening experience, and we just, I just want to thank everybody who spent time with us here helping us to make sure that we put forth the best recommendation document that we can put together all of your ideas input suggestions,

16:58:37 comments will be taken seriously. We are going to definitely go down the list and discuss each and everyone.

16:58:46 Thank you so much. I'm going to hand it over to Dr. Melendez to close us out.

16:58:51 Thank you so much. Principal, a free for all of the work you've put into this working group. And for this conversation that you've led today, alongside all of your support.

16:59:03 I want to.

16:59:04 On behalf of the chancellor, I am incredibly appreciative of all of you taking the time on this work to to play a leadership role in, in, in this working group.

16:59:17 And this is a critically important work for the New York City public schools and we are greatly appreciative and incredibly committed to this work, and you wanted to make sure to communicate that to not just the working group members but to all of you

16:59:28 that joined the conversation.